KARACHI PORT TRUST

GATEWAY TO PAKISTAN

76 Years

TECHNICAL EVALUATION REPORT
(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1. Name of Procuring Agency: **Karachi Port Trust**
2. Method of Procurement: Notice for inviting Tenders through News Papers Published in Daily The Nation & Daily Dunya on 21-07-2024, KPT & PPRA Websites on 25-07-2024, under PPRA Rule 36(b) from Bidders i-e Single Stage Two Envelope.
3. Title of Procurement: **REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF.**
4. Tender Inquiry No.: E/N-2(168)/
5. PPRA Ref. No. (TSE): TS543933E
6. Date & Time of Bid Closing: 13-08-2024 at 1100 Hrs.
7. Date & Time of Bid Opening: 13-08-2024 at 1130 Hrs.
8. No of Bids Received: 04 Nos.
9. Criteria for Bid Evaluation: As per TOR
10. Details of Bid(s) Evaluation: Given Below

S. No.	Name of Bidder	Technical Marks (if applicable)	Rule/Regulation/SBD/ Policy/ Basis for Technical Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PPRA Rules-2020
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor	**83.75**	**Qualified**
2.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.	**80.83**	**Disqualified (by the Virtue of Blacklisting firm in PPRA BLK-106**
3.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers	**80.00**	**Qualified**
4.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	**75.42**	**Qualified**

11. **NIL**

Signature: .....

Official Stamp: .....

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (NORTH)
KARACHI PORT TRUST

Shaukat Ali Shaikh & Associates

Advocates and Legal Consultants

High Courts & Supreme Court of Pakistan

403, Asad Chamber
146 Shambu Nath St
Near Passport Office
Saddar; Karachi.
Cell: 0333-3261159

To,
Syed Imtiaz Hussain Shah,
Manager Legal Affairs, KPT

Background:
It has come to our attention that M/S N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co Pvt Ltd has submitted a bid to participate in a recent tendering process initiated by KPT This Company was previously blacklisted on the Public Procurement Regulatory Authority (PPRA) due to the submission of forged documents. While the company now operates under a different name, all other identifying information remains the same (i.e., address, license number, and relevant certifications). The company has provided an undertaking asserting that it is not blacklisted.

Legal Issues for Consideration:
The legal issues under consideration are:

1. Whether the change of the company's name removes the effects of its previous blacklisting.
2. Whether the company's bid can be considered valid under PPRA Rules despite the prior blacklisting.

Relevant Provisions of Law:

1. **Public Procurement Rules, 2004** (PPRA Rules):
   - **Rule 18.**
     The procuring agency shall disqualify a supplier or contractor if it finds, at any time, that the information submitted by him concerning his qualification as supplier or contractor was false and materially inaccurate or incomplete.
   - **Rule 19(1) and (4)**
     Provides that procuring agencies may disqualify or exclude any company or individual from participation if they are involved in fraudulent, corrupt, or collusive practices, or any other activity that could undermine fair competition.
     A bidder who has been declared blacklisted or debarred by a foreign country, international organization or other foreign institutions shall be treated as blacklisted and debarred from participating in any public procurement proceedings or entering into any public contract for such period as declared by that foreign country, international organizations or other foreign institutions.

2. **Companies Act, 2017**:
Section 13(3)
   - (3) The change of name shall not affect any rights or obligations of thecompany, or render defective any legal proceedings by or against the companyand any legal proceedings that might have been continued or commenced against the company by its former name may be continued by or commenced against the company by its new name.

1. **Validity of the Undertaking**: The Company's undertaking stating that it is "not blacklisted" appears to be misleading and potentially fraudulent, as PPRA's blacklisting remains in effect against the entity, notwithstanding the name change. Under PPRA Rules, providing misleading information is a serious offense that could further disqualify a company from participation.

Shaukat Ali Shaikh & Associates

Advocates and Legal Consultants

High Courts & Supreme Court of Pakistan

403, Asad Chamber
146 Shambu Nath St.
Near Passport Office
Saddar; Karachi.
Cell: 0333-3261159

2. **Implications of Blacklisting under a Different Name**: The blacklisting by PPRA is imposed on the legal entity, not merely the name it operates under. Changing the company name does not negate the blacklisting; rather, it continues to apply to the legal entity as a whole. The PPRA Rules and legal precedents establish that disqualified entities cannot bypass sanctions through rebranding.
3. **Liabilities and Legal Continuity**: Under the Companies Act, 2017, and legal principles in Pakistani law, a name change does not create a new entity. Thus, the company's prior liabilities and restrictions remain applicable. Considering this, M/S N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co Pvt Ltd remains subject to its blacklisting status until the PPRA or an appropriate authority formally lifts this restriction.

In light of the above analysis, it is our opinion that KPT should not accept M/S N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co Pvt Ltd's bid on the following grounds:

1. **Continued Applicability of Blacklisting**: The blacklisting imposed by PPRA remains in effect regardless of the change in the company's name. By participating in this bidding process, the company has attempted to circumvent the PPRA sanctions, which is legally impermissible.

2. **Misrepresentation in the Undertaking**: The undertaking by M/S N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co Pvt Ltddeclaring itself as not blacklisted is misleading and raises serious concerns regarding compliance with PPRA Rules.

3. **Risk of Legal Liability**: Accepting this company's bid may expose KPTto legal challenges from other bidders and regulatory scrutiny, given the PPRA restrictions.

We recommend that KPT in case where the firm has furnished an undertaking contrary to the fact that the said firm is blacklisted on website off PPRA, the procuring agency may issue show cause notice to the firm giving out evidence of its being blacklisted. The show cause notice must indicate that in case the undertaking given is found to be false, the firm will be blacklisted by KPT and security & performance deposit will be forfeited

Based on the application of Pakistani law, M/S N Hussain Engineering & EMP Co Pvt Ltd's change of name does not invalidate the blacklisting imposed by PPRA. As such, its bid should be rejected on grounds of misrepresentation and ongoing disqualification under the PPRA Rules. Should the entity seek future eligibility, it must obtain formal relief from the PPRA, explicitly lifting the blacklisting status.

No. 52/bid/Legal / 2711
dt 21-11-2024

Forwarded to G.M. (C&DE) with the request to take in accordance with the legal opinion further being fortified with the legal opinion of PRO.

Shaukat Ali Shaikh & Associates

KARACHI PORT TRUST
ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT

No. E/N-2(168)/
Dated:

1. **ENGR. M. WAQAR AZEEM**
   Executive Engineer (W)
2. **ENGR. SALMAN BASHIR**
   Executive Engineer (PW)
3. **ENGR. MUHAMMAD KHAN**
   Asst. Executive Engineer (W)
4. **MANAGER FINANCE**
   Finance Division

SUB: REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I. YARD WEST WHARF.

I am directed to convey the instructions of the worthy Chief Engineer, which are with reference to the above subject, wherein the Technical Bids of the Participating Bidders were opened on dated 13-08-2024 and accordingly, a Committee has been constituted by the Chief Engineer comprising of the following Officers of the Departments for the scrutiny of Technical Bids.

1.	**Dy. Chief Engineer-III**	**Convener**
2.	**Executive Engineer (N)**	**Member**
3.	**Executive Engineer (PW)**	**Member**
4.	**Asst. Executive Engineer (W)**	**Member**
5.	**Rep. of Finance Division**	**Member**

Manager (F), KPT is requested to nominate the officer of Finance Department as a Member of Evaluation Committee and communicate his name to this office, please.

In view of the above instructions, the said Committee is therefore directed to scrutinize the Technical Bids of all the Bidders, as per the TOR and submit their Report within 03 days, positively.

This issues with the approval of Chief Engineer.

DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III

Copy to:

GENERAL MANAGER (CW) / CHIEF ENGINEER	For kind information, please.

Blacklisted/Debarred Firms-Pakistan

Rule 19 of the Public Procurement Rules, 2004 (amended vide S.R.O. No. 834(I)/2021 dated 28th June, 2021) requires that

The procuring agency shall devise a comprehensive mechanism for blacklisting and debarment of bidders for a specified time in accordance with regulations made by the Authority, and the bidder or the bidders shall be declared as-

(a) blacklisted and henceforth cross debarred for participation in any public procurement or disposal proceedings for the period of not more than ten years, if corrupt and fraudulent practice as defined in these rules is established against the bidder or the bidders in pursuance of blacklisting proceedings;

(b) blacklisted and henceforth cross debarred for participation in respective category of public procurement or disposal proceedings for a period of not more than three years, if the bidder fails to perform his contractual obligations during the execution of contract or breaches the contract due to his capacity and capability to perform or otherwise. However, procuring agency shall initiate such blacklisting or debarment proceedings after exhausting the forum of arbitration, provided that such provision exists in the conditions of contract, and if such failure or breach is covered in the respective dispute settlement clauses of the contract, and

(c) blacklisted and henceforth cross debarred for participation in respective category of public procurement or disposal proceedings for a period of not more than six months, if the bidder fails to abide with a bid securing declaration, however without being indulged in any corrupt and fraudulent practice.

(3) The bidder may file the review petition before the Authority within thirty days of communication of such blacklisting or barring action after depositing the prescribed fee and in accordance with procedure issued by the Authority, and the Authority shall evaluate the case and decide within ninety days of filing of review petition. The decision of the Authority shall be considered as final

In observance of the above said Rule, various procuring agencies reported the firms which they have blacklisted/debarred permanently or temporarily to PPRA, as per details given below.

Total Current Blacklisted/Debarred Firms (192)

PPRA No.	Name of Procurement Agency	Firm/Company Name	Address	Firm/Company Owner Details	From	To	Reasons	Type of Blacklisting/ Debarment
BLK-304	Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences	M/S Malik Enterprises	Shop 58, Ismail Jee Market, 2nd Floor, Jinnah Road, Rawalpindi		14-10-2024	13-10-2025	Failed to fulfill Contractual Obligations.	Temporary
BLK-303	Pakistan Institute of Medical Sciences	M/S Abaseen General Order Supplier	House No. 1049, St 56, Sector I-14/3, Islamabad		10-10-2024	09-04-2025	Failed to fulfill Contractual Obligations.	Temporary
BLK-302	Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Medical University	M/S Services Syan Group	889-B Ashiana-e-Quaid Feroz purr Road, Lahore		24-08-2024	23-02-2025	Failed to fulfill Contractual Obligations.	Temporary
BLK-303	Directorate of Procurement (Air)	M/S Techno Link System, Faisalabad	House No. P-613, Street No. 08 Gurunank Pura, Faisalabad.		11-09-2024	10-09-2027	Failed to submit any reply.	Temporary
BLK-302	Sui Southern Gas Company Limited, Karachi	M/S Brother Gas Bottling & Distribution Company Pvt Ltd (Local Agent)	Office No. 947 Tricon Business Centre, 9th Floor Main Boulevard, Gulberg, Lahore		06-08-2024	07-08-2026	Failed/Refuse to Deliver Material.	Temporary
BLK-301	Sui Southern Gas Company Limited, Karachi	M/S S.I Raza Co. (Pvt.) Ltd	Plot No. A-681, Block 12, Gulberg F.B Area Karachi		23-07-2024	22-07-2026	Failed/Refuse to Deliver Material	Temporary

CHIEF ENGINEER PUBLIC HEALTH ENGG: DIV. K.P.K.

CamScanner

LK-109	Trading Corporation of Pakistan (Pvt) Limited	M/S Macca Sugar Mills	65-Inantry Road, Lahore		23-02-2022	-	Failure to Perform the Contract Awarded.	Permanent
BLK-108	Trading Corporation of Pakistan (Pvt) Limited	M/S Haq Bahu Sugar Mills	65-Inantry Road, Lahore		23-02-2022	-	Failure to Perform the the Contract Awarded.	Permanent
BLK-107	Pakistan Petroleum Limited	M/S SHEZ & MO PVT LTD	C-4 Ground Floor, Sunny View, Block-14, Gulistan-e-Johar, Karachi		18-02-2022	17-02-2026	Indulging in Fraudulent Practices.	Temporary
BLK-106	Pakistan Petroleum Limited	M/S Hussain Construction Services	Bungalow No.67, Central GOVT. Employees Co-operative Housing Society, Block-10A, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi.		07-09-2021	06-09-2031	Submission of Forged/Fake letters.	Temporary
BLK-103	Ministry of Defence Production	M/S Communication & Machinery Corp (CMC)	Mezzanine Floor, 2-C, 12th Badar Commercial Off 26th Street, Phase-V, D.H.A Karachi-75000		13-01-2017	-	Poor Performance and non-fulfill the Contractual Obligation	Permanent
BLK-102	Islamabad High Court (IHC)	M/S Mehr & Sons	Office No. 2, 2nd Floor, Sarwar Plaza, Shamsabad, Rawalpindi		15-02-2022	-	Submission of Fake Bid Security Banker Cheque.	Permanent
BLK-101	Pakistan Industrial Development Corporation	M/S Gul Construction Company	Plot No. 815/C, Block-2 Central Commercial Area P.E.C.H.S, Karachi		29-12-2020	28-12-2025	Due to Fake Bank Guarantee	Temporary
BLK-100	Pakistan Industrial Development Corporation	M/S Arch Vision, Consulting Engineers, Environmentalist & Architects	C-89, Block-8, Gulshan-e-Iqbal, Karachi		29-12-2020	28-12-2025	Due to Fraudulent Act	Temporary
BLK-97	Pakistan Petroleum Limited	M/S Sheeraz Engineering Works	H-3 Old Sheikh Colony Near Gate No. 5 Sui Gas Field, Sui		08-02-2022	07-02-2026	Non-Submission of Performance Guarantee and misrepresentation of fact.	Temporary

DY. CHIEF ENGINEER (ENGG: DIV.) P.D. K.P.T.

CamScanner

Initial Date of Registration in PEC: Feb 08, 2011

Scan QR code to view details.

Serial No. [illegible]

PEC-11

PAKISTAN ENGINEERING COUNCIL

Licence No: 1476 Category: C1/E Validity: 30 June, 2022

LICENCE OF PAKISTANI CONSTRUCTOR ~~OPERATOR~~

(Under the bye-laws of Pakistan Engineering Council 1987)

This is to certify that M/s N. HUSSAIN ENGINEERING & EMP COMPANY (PRIVATE) LIMITED (Old Name: HUSSAIN CONSTRUCTION SERVICES) (Licencee), with its registered office at B-67,CENTRAL GOVT.EMPLOYEES CO-OPERATIVE, HOUSING SOCIETY, BLOCK-10-A, GULSHAN-E-IQBAL, KARACHI have been licenced under Construction and Operation of Engineering Works Bye-laws 1987, until the validity date to construct/~~operate~~ engineering works, the construction/capital cost of which does not exceed Rs. 2500 (TWENTY, FIVE HUNDRED) million provided the licencee fulfils all the qualification requirements prescribed by Client or Employer for a particular engineering work; and subject to the licencee continuing to fulfill all the requirements of the bye-laws.

Field of Specialization BC01 - BC02 - CE01 - CE02 - CE03 - CE04 (Irrigation & Flood Control Systems) - CE04 (Water Retaining Structures) - CE05 - CE08 - CE09 - CE10 - EE01 - EE02 - EE03 - EE04 - EE06 - EE09 - EE10 - EE11 (General Electrical Works Only) - ME01 - ME02 - ME04 - ME05 - ME06 - (TWENTY FOUR ONLY) (Specialization Code Nos. for detail see overleaf)

Date of Issue: Mar 29, 2022
(Islamabad)

Registrar
Pakistan Engineering Council,
Islamabad.

Note:

1. If a firm does not get renewal of its license within a year after expiry of its license, the firm may be renewed after payment of outstanding fee if entire defaulting period plus surcharge at the rate of 5% of defaulting fee amount, or as prescribed from time to time.
2. The employer must ensure employment of engineers whose names are mentioned on backside of the licence. The Consulting Engineer (the Engineer Incharge in case the consultant is not appointed) shall monitor the number of engineers employed by the Constructor/Operator and inform the Council accordingly.
3. Owner(s) of the firm shall be held responsible, if any information, document or paper submitted by him/them is found incorrect or forged.
4. Supervisory Engineers will be replaced/ presented by 30-Jun-2022 as per policy in vogue.

2484497

CHIEF ENGG: DIV.

S.NO 34

KARACHI POR TRUST
ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT

REVIST

TECHNICAL EVALUATION SHEET
REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT WEST WHARF.

TENDER OPENED ON:13-AUG-2024 **FILE NO.E/N-2(168)/**

S.NO	NAME OF FIRM	MANDATORY REQUIREMENT								TECHNICAL EVALUATION						FINANCIAL CAPABILITIES TURN OVER	SCORE			REMARKS
		SIGNED DOC TO RETURN	PAY ORDER	PROFILE	P.E.C	NO LITIGATION	N.T.N	A.T.L	S.R.B	EXPERIENCE			PERSONALS				MAX. MARKS	OBTAINED MARKS	BROUGHT TO PERCENTILE	
										YEAR OF ESTAB	SIMILAR PROJECTS	SIZEABLE PROJECTS	ENGINEER	R.E	D.A.E					
	MAX. MARKS									15	15	20	20	20	10	20	120			
1	M/S AL-MADAD CONSTT. CO.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	12.50	9	14	20	14	7	14	120	90.50	75.42	
2	M/S AL-MEENA MARINE ENG.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	15	10	12	20	12	7	20	120	96.00	80.00	
3	M/S N.HUSSAIN ENGG.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	11	10	12	17	18	9	20	120	97.00	80.83	DISQUALIFIED Adv. 3(e)
4	M/S DEEN MUHAMMAD GOVT. CONTRACTORS	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	12.50	12	16	15	18	7	20	120	100.50	83.75	

* M/s N. Hussain Engg & EMP Company (Pvt) Ltd. Disqualified by virtue of Blacklisting firm in (PPRA. Rule-10(a)).

MEMBER
ASSISTANT EX:ENGINEER (WORKS)

MEMBER
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (P.W)

MEMBER
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (NORTH)

MEMBER
REP. OF FINANCE DIVISION

COVENOR
DY.CHIEF ENGINEER-III

No.30

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE HELD ON 09-10-2024 IN THE COMMITTEE ROOM OF THE ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT, KPT.

NAME OF WORK:- **REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF.**

1. West Wharf plays a critical role for global trade and commerce of our country serving as hubs for the exchange of goods and commodities. In the circumstances it requires to update the port infrastructure Within Port limits, in which the storage Sheds are one of the essential component for storage, protection of goods and logistics operations in safe and sound manner to avoid untoward incidences from extreme weather conditions too.

2. Dy. Traffic Manager (W) vide letter placed at S. No.01 had requested for repair of Sheds at West Wharf, to attend said works, the concerned AXEN (MIY) visited each and every shed to ascertain the required works. During the visit the identification of structural deficiency, leaks, repair of gates, platform, drainage etc has been observed, which are required to be attended necessary to avoid any unforeseen incidence and to improve structural integrity and functionality of sheds. Most of the gates are eroded, steel plates are broken some of shed gates were malfunctioning as reported by concerned DTM staff. (Photographs attached at S.No. 02) for kind reference.

3. It is pertinent to mention here that there exists Total **09 Nos.** of Sheds at West Wharf, which are being used for different purposes for storage of valuable cargo. The overall area of these sheds are **40,000 Sqr.Mtr** (Approx).

4. Keeping in view of the present situation of handing over the East wharf to AD Ports, it become essential to rehabilitate / renovate these sheds to overcome the rush of cargo planned to moved to West Wharf.

5. Keeping in view the above scenario, the repairing of sheds at West Wharf is crucial for maintain the efficiency and safety of Port Operations, Civil Works Division aims to address the existing repair and maintain challenges to enhance the operational resilience and to ensure the continue success of Port facilities in nurturing global trade.

6. Accordingly, the tenders were invited through Press on 21-07-2024 and KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 25-07-2024 and received on 13-08-2024 in accordance under Rule 36 (b) of PPRA.

7. In response, the following (04) Four Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor

8. Technical Proposals for the above Four firms were opened on same day in presence of the Committee Members or their representative.

9. After the opening of Technical Proposals, an In-house Committee comprising on the following members was constituted by the Chief Engineer KPT vide letter at S.No.20, to examine the received Technical Bid as per criteria and submit their Technical Evaluation Report as per the practice in vogue.

1.	Engr. Syed Jamil Akhtar	Dy. Chief Engineer-III	Convener
2.	Engr. M. Waqar Azeem	Executive Engineer (N)	Member
3.	Engr. Salman Basheer	Executive Engineer (PW)	Member
4.	Engr. Muhammad Khan	Asst. Executive Engineer (W)	Member
5.	Rep. of Finance Division	Finance Officer	Member

10. The Technical Evaluation Criteria of the bidders as mentioned in the Advertisement / Tender Documents is as under:

a. Duly licensed by the Pakistan Engineering Council (PEC) category C-3 and above with specialized code CE-01, CE-10 & CE-11 above valid on the date of opening of Tender.

b. Copy of latest Valid NTN, SRB Certificates.
c. Online Tax verification (fresh copy of ATL).
d. Company Profile.
e. Copy of Valid PEC Registration Certificate.
f. Affidavit, that the firm is not defaulter in Income tax department nor blacklisted by any Organization.
g. Provision of Audited Financial Statement for last 03Years showing minimum turnover of Rs. 60.0 Million. (As also specified in the S.No.PP-13).

h. Relevant work experience (as laid down in Bidding Documents).
i. All submission will be duly signed & stamped by the Bidder.

11. After due diligence, the Committee submitted its detail report as (placed at S.No.28) for reference. As per the Technical Evaluation Report of In-house Committee, The following four Bidders have been considered qualified in accordance with the given criteria:

S. No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor

RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE IN-HOUSE COMMITTEE:

It is pertinent to mention here that, repairing of sheds at West Wharf is crucial for maintain the efficiency and safety of Port Operations, Civil Works Division aims to address the existing repair and maintain challenges to enhance the operational resilience and to ensure the continue success of Port facilities in nurturing global trade. Hence, the Technical Evaluation Committee after due diligence has recommended the following Bidders who stood Technically Qualified, after the due scrutiny of the received Technical Bids, details mentioned as under:

S. NO	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	OBTAINED MARKS IN TERMS OF PERCENTAGE	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	**75.42**	**Qualified**
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers	**80.00**	**Qualified**
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.	**80.83**	**Qualified**
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor	**83.75**	**Qualified**

ENGR. MUHAMMAD KHAN
ASST. EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (W)
MEMBER

ENGR. SALMAN BASHIR
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (PW)
(MEMBER)

ENGR. M. WAQAR AZEEM
EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (N)
(MEMBER)

FINANCE OFFICER
(MEMBER)

ENGR. SYED JAMIL AKHTAR
DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III
(CONVENER)

RECOMMENDATIONS OF DEPARTMENTAL TENDER COMMITTEE:

15. The in-house Technical Evaluation Committee has carried out the Evaluation of the Bids and has recommended all 04 firms Technically Qualified.

16. Accordingly, the Technical Evaluation Report was placed before the DTC members, who have also endorsed the Report / Recommendation of In-House Technical Committee & the same is now being placed before the Chairman KPT, so that the necessary approval for the opening of Financial Proposals of the Technically Qualified firms may be sought.

17. In the light of above DTC Committee's Report, Chairman sanction is therefore solicited for the approval of opening of Financial Bids of following Technically Qualified firms:-

S. No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor

GENERAL MANAGER (O)
(MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (E)
(MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (P&D)
(MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (F)
(MEMBER)

PORT INTELLEGENCE OFFICER
(MEMBER)

GENERAL MANAGER (CW)
(CONVENOR)

PP-26

M-I

NAME OF WORK: **REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF.**

1. The tenders for the subject work were invited through Press on 21-07-2024 and KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 25-07-2024 and received on 13-08-2024 in accordance under Rule 36 (b) of PPRA. In response, the following (04) Four Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor

2. After due diligence, the In-House Committee submitted its detail report, as per the Technical Evaluation Report of In-house Committee, the following four Bidders were considered qualified.

S. NO	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	OBTAINED MARKS IN TERMS OF PERCENTAGE	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor	**83.75**	**Qualified**
2.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.	**80.83**	**Qualified**
3.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers	**80.00**	**Qualified**
4.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	**75.42**	**Qualified**

3. Subsequently, Technical Report was placed before the DTC's Committee and the same was agreed with the recommendations of the Technical Evaluation Committee and further it was recommended that, Financial Bids of Technically Qualified firms for the work may please be opened, with the approval of Competent Authority.

4. Accordingly the case for the approval of the Chairman KPT regarding opening of the Financial Proposals were forwarded on 21-10-2024, and the still at a waited.

5. However, as per recent developments it has been observed/revealed the M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd. has been disqualified in another Project of this department due to reason that the said firm M/s. N. Hussain Eng. & Emp. Co. Pvt. Ltd was blacklisted with its old Name i.e. M/s. N. Hussain Construction Services on PPRA website vide PPRA No. BLK-106 by Pakistan petroleum limited due to submission of forged / fake letters for a period of 10 years w.e.f. 07-09-2021(ref. at F/A) to 07-09-2031.

6. Furthermore, M/s. N. Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd. has also submitted an Affidavit, wherein he has mentioned that his firm is not Blacklisted, in any Government organization whereas actually the said firm is blacklisted with its old Name on PPRA website.

PP-27

7. Keeping this scenario in view this department has already acquired an opinion from Legal Department, through his advise (Copy to Enclosed) wherein, they have also endorsed and advised to not consider his Bids in the forthcoming tenders.

8. Hence in light of the above scenario, this department would like to request Chairman KPT's approval to revise the in-house committee Evaluation Report and the Departmental Tender Committee Recommendations pertaining to procurement process of the subject work and resubmit the same for further approval of Competent Authority, please.

Submitted, please.

12/02/25

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (N)

DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III

13/02/25.

CHIEF ENGINEER/
GENERAL MANAGER (CW)

13/2/2025

THRU: SECRETARY, K.P.T.

13/2

CHAIRMAN, K.P.T.

GM (CW)

13/2

Dy. CE (III)

Do needful as mentioned

XEN (N)

14/2/25

KARACHI PORT TRUST
I.R. No. 40
Date 14/2/25
General Manager (Civil Works & Estate)

KARACHI PORT TRUST
422
13 FEB 2025
SECRETARIAT

14/2/2025

From Pre-page

PP-29

M-1

1. In continuation to the minutes of the meeting of the Departmental Tender Committee meeting held on 09-10-2024 (placed at F/A), it is submitted that as per the recent developments observed in one of the tender evaluation of the project viz. Rehabilitation and Installation of New Fenders and Nosing at Berths No. 18,19,20 and 21 at West Wharf, it has been revealed that **M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp. Co. Pvt. Ltd. has been blacklisted with its Old Name i.e, M/s Hussain Construction Services vide PPRA No. BLK-106** by Pakistan Petroleum Limited for a period of 10 years w.e.f. 07-09-2021 due to submission of forged / fake letters (copy of PEC license renewal certificate awarded to M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp Co. Pvt Ltd bearing old name M/s Hussain Construction Services is placed at F/B as a ready reference).

2. Accordingly, a meeting of all the members of the inhouse committee constituted by the Chief Engineer vide PP-20 and letter placed at F/C was held on 19-02-2024 wherein it was unanimously decided that, considering the aforementioned scenario, the status of M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp. Co. shall be revised / amended to be declared as **Disqualified** in the report of the inhouse Technical Evaluation Report. The revisited status of inhouse Technical Evaluation Report is as under:

S.No.	Name of Firms	Status
1	M/s Al Madad Construction Co.	Qualified
2	M/s Al Meena Marine Engineers	Qualified
3	M/s Deen Muhammad Govt Contractor	Qualified
4	M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp. Co. Pvt. Ltd.	Disqualified

3. This is submitted in light of the earlier request as approved by the Competent Authority for revision / revisiting of the In House Technical Evaluation report placed at PP-27.

4. Submitted, Please.

Engr. Muhammad Khan
Asst. Executive Engineer
Member

Engr. M. Waqar Azeem
Executive Engineer
Member

Engr. Salman Bashir
Executive Engineer
Member

Mr. Harris Usman
Finance Officer
Member

Engr. Syed Jamil Akhter
Dy. Chief Engineer-III
Convener

General Manager (Civil Works)
Convener
Departmental Tender Committee

Agreed Para-1 to 2, and Put up revise proposal for opening of financial bids of qualified bidders.

PP-30

M-I

NAME OF WORK: **REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF.**

1. The tenders for the subject work were invited through Press on 21-07-2024 and KPT / PPRA & MoMA Websites on 25-07-2024 and received on 13-08-2024 in accordance under Rule 36 (b) of PPRA. In response, the following (04) Four Firms have submitted their sealed Technical / Financial Proposals.

S.No.	Name of Firms
1.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers
3.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.
4.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor

2. After due diligence, the In-House Committee submitted its detailed report attached at F/A and as per the Technical Evaluation Report of In-house Committee, all the four Bidders were considered qualified. Subsequently, Technical Report was placed before the DTC's Committee and the same was agreed with the recommendations of the Technical Evaluation Committee and further it was recommended that, Financial Bids of Technically Qualified firms for the work may please be opened, with the approval of Competent Authority. (F/B)

3. Accordingly the case for the approval of the Chairman KPT regarding opening of the Financial Proposals were forwarded on 21-10-2024. (PP-23).

4. However, as per recent developments it has been observed/revealed the M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd. has been disqualified in another Project of this department due to reason that the said firm M/s. N. Hussain Eng. & Emp. Co. Pvt. Ltd was blacklisted with its old Name i.e. M/s. N. Hussain Construction Services on PPRA website vide PPRA No. BLK-106 by Pakistan petroleum limited due to submission of forged / fake letters for a period of 10 years w.e.f. 07-09-2021(ref. at F/C) to 07-09-2031.

5. Furthermore, M/s. N. Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd. has also submitted an Affidavit, wherein he has mentioned that his firm is not Blacklisted, in any Government organization whereas actually the said firm is blacklisted with its old Name on PPRA website.

6. Keeping this scenario in view this department has already acquired an opinion from Legal Department, through his advise (Copy to Enclosed) wherein, they have also endorsed and advised to not consider his Bids in the forthcoming tenders. (F/D).

7. Considering the scenario explained above the Chief Engineering Department requested the Chairman KPT for revisiting / revision of the inhouse committee' Evaluation Report and DTC recommendations The Chairman KPT, in response has approved the request of the Chief Engineering Department and returned back the original file without any action vide PP-27.

8. Accordingly, the meeting of the inhouse evaluation committee was held on 19-02-2025, wherein, it was recommended to Disqualify the one blacklisted firm i.e, M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp. Co.

PP-31

Pvt. Ltd. whereas the status of all the other firms shall remain same as per the previous report. The status of revised evaluation is tabulated as under:

S. NO	NAME OF QUALIFIED FIRMS	REMARKS
1.	M/s. Deen Muhammad Govt. Contractor	**Qualified**
2.	M/s. Al-Meena Marine Engineers	**Qualified**
3.	M/s. Al-Madad Construction Co.	**Qualified**
4.	M/s. N Hussain Engineering & EMP Company (Pvt.) Ltd.	**Disqualified as the firm is blacklisted by its old name M/s Hussain Construction Services on PPRA website vide PPRA NO. BLK-106**

9. Accordingly, the Convener of the Departmental Tender Committee has also endorsed the revised recommendations of the inhouse evaluation committee vide PP-29.

10. Hence in light of the above Chairman KPT's approval for opening of Financial Bids of the 03 Nos Technically Qualified firms and return of the unopened financial bid of the Disqualified firm i.e, M/s N Hussain Engg. & Emp. Co. Pvt. Ltd. for the work of "**REPAIR / RENOVATION OF VARIOUS SHEDS AT M.I YARD WEST WHARF".**

Submitted, please.

21/02/25

EXECUTIVE ENGINEER (N)

DY. CHIEF ENGINEER-III

24/02/25.

CHIEF ENGINEER/
GENERAL MANAGER (CW)

24/2/2025.

KARACHI PORT TRUST
544
25 FEB 2025
SECRETARIAT

e-filed
27/2/25

THRU: SECRETARY, K.P.T.

25/2

CHAIRMAN, K.P.T.

GM(CW)

26/2

Dy. CE(III)

27/2/25.

KARACHI PORT TRUST
I.R. No. 54
Date 24/2/25
27/2/25
General Manager (Civil Works & Estate)

(PTO)